



Staff Report

File #: REPORT 22-0067, Version: 1

**Honorable Mayor and Members of the Hermosa Beach City Council
Adjourned Regular Meeting of January 31, 2022**

REVIEW OF CITY PARKING PROGRAMS

(Community Development Director Ken Robertson,
Finance Director Viki Copeland, and
Police Community Services Manager Peter Ahlstrom)

Recommended Action:

Part A-staff recommends City Council review and discuss the status and priorities of the 12 recommendations in the Parking Management Study and challenges of coordinating these efforts with goals of Plan Hermosa and the City's efforts to certify a Local Coastal Program with the Coastal Commission.

Part B-staff recommends City Council receive an update and discuss the following topics:

1. Street Meter and Parking Lot Parking Rates;
2. Parking Time Limits;
3. Parking Citation Fine Comparisons with Other Cities; and
4. Coastal Commission Review and Approval Process.

Part C-staff recommends City Council receive an update and discuss the following topics:

1. Resident Permit Program and Fees;
2. Employee Permit Program and Fees; and
3. Coastal Commission Review and Approval Process.

Executive Summary:

This report is intended to be a comprehensive review of City parking programs and is broken up into three parts:

- A. Review of Coastal Zone Parking Management Study Recommendations;
- B. Review Street Metered and Public Parking Lot Metered Programs Including Rates and Parking Citation Fines; and
- C. Review Residential and Employee Parking Permit Program.

Background:

The Parking Management Study and Recommended Parking Standards for the Coastal Zone

(Parking Study) was accepted by the City Council in late 2019, including 12 recommendations with actions to be completed (**Attachment A2**). Progress has been made on many of these recommendations, but this is the first comprehensive review since December 2019 when the recommendations were accepted by the City Council. The Parking Study is part of the City's efforts to achieve full certification of a Local Coastal Program fully funded through a grant from the California Coastal Commission. The City submitted the study recommendations, along with the Mobility Element in October 2021, as a first step in the City's efforts to have a fully certified Local Coastal Program with the Coastal Commission.

Past Council Actions

Meeting Date	Description
June 6, 2018	The City Council held a Budget Workshop, including Year Five Financial Forecast, including recommendations for increased citation fines. At the City Council requested a survey for all parking violations.
December 17, 2019	The City Council accepted the Coastal Zone Parking Assessment Study recommendations; Directed staff to return to Council and the applicable Commissions with the related implementation actions for each of the term recommendations and Directed staff to incorporate the policy recommendations into the Draft Local Coastal Program and, if appropriate, draft an amendment to the City's Coastal Development Permit for the Preferential Parking Program and Remote Beach Park and Ride System.
September 14, 2021	The City Council approved amending and updating the City's Certified Coastal Land Use Plan, focused on the Mobility Element, and authorized submittal to the California Coastal Commission.
September 28, 2021	The City Council requested that City Parking Programs and Parking Management be discussed at a future meeting.

Discussion:

At its September 28, 2021 meeting, City Council requested a review of the City's parking programs be placed on a future City Council agenda. Parking was originally scheduled as part of the revenue study session, but after the request by the City Council, it was scheduled for a standalone study session. The parking study session allows time to review current information and have a full discussion on the multi-faceted parking issues without the pressure of moving on to other topics at the revenue study session.

Part A-review of Coastal Zone Parking Management Study Recommendations

In 2019, the City received a grant from the California Coastal Commission to conduct technical studies and develop a draft Coastal Land Use Plan and Implementation Plan that covers a range of

topics from sea level rise, overnight accommodations, and parking resources. The Coastal Zone Parking Management study evaluates current parking resources, programs, and opportunities to improve the availability of Coastal Zone parking resources in a manner that balances coastal access requirements with efficient use of the City's limited land resources and achievement of the City's economic development and mobility goals.

The Parking Study extensively reviewed the existing conditions and various parking programs to make parking management recommendations. **Attachment A1** summarizes progress made on the twelve recommendations.

The goals of the Parking Study were to:

1. Create a parking system that meets the parking needs and demands of residents, visitors, and employees in an efficient and cost-effective manner;
2. Modify parking standards to encourage revitalization and investment in a pedestrian-oriented district; and
3. Expand mobility options and optimize parking availability.

The parking management recommendations vary in cost, level of difficulty, priority, implementation timeline, recommended zones for implementation, and relation to study goals. These recommendations require initiatives involving several City departments.

As part of the City's effort to update the Local Coastal Plan (Land Use Plan or LUP), the City submitted the Mobility Element of the General Plan to the California Coastal Commission in October 2021, after City staff and Commission staff agreed to begin the Local Coastal Program review and approval process with the policies of the Mobility Element. This is a major step toward the goal of obtaining an approved Local Coastal Program. Staff revised the Mobility Element to include Parking Study recommendations.

The existing Local Coastal Plan (Land Use Plan or LUP) was adopted and certified in 1981 and has been revised periodically since that time, most recently in 2004. A link to the City's Local Coastal Plan (Land Use Plan or LUP) is included as **Attachment A3**. The City has never achieved full certification of a Local Coastal Program, which also must include an Implementation Program (IP).

Part B-review Street Metered and Public Parking Lot Metered Programs Including Rates and Parking Citation Fines

Implementation of an App-Based Mobile Pay System

Parking efficiencies can be improved with the Parking Study recommendation of an application-based mobile pay system. The Parking Study noted that most existing payment systems are antiquated resulting in circling around high-demand areas. After parking, drivers must leave their car

and check the meter before they would know the cost of parking in that space. After a driver pays with coins or card, users with longer visits tend to need to return to the car and “feed the meter” if they wished to stay longer. Drivers are also compelled to find a new parking space if they have hit the hours restriction or cut their visit short. Implementing an application-based mobile pay system for parking would allow drivers to more easily locate open spaces, know the price of the space in real-time, and be able to pay for the parking space from anywhere. There are wide-ranging benefits with minor infrastructure changes for implementing a mobile payment system.

The Community Services Division has recently released a Request for Proposal (RFP) for this service and is currently reviewing proposals from parking vendors to implement this recommendation. A mobile payment system would also provide parking data to better inform future parking rate adjustments discussions.

During the past 18 months, the Community Services Division has continued work to improve the existing parking meter infrastructure, despite pandemic staffing issues and supply chain constraints. There are approximately 500 coin-only meters remaining and the full replacement project should be completed within 2023. Telecommunications vendors (e.g., T-Mobile and Verizon) have informed our meter vendor that the transition from 2G/3G technology will also be moving forward in 2023, despite pandemic supply chain issues. The City currently has approximately 400 meters that utilize 2G/3G technology requiring upgrades. City Council’s past approval of meter purchases for the current fiscal year will allow the meter upgrade to occur but integrating the 2G/3G upgrade has slowed the replacement plan for the coin only meters.

The application-based mobile pay system would help the City implement the Parking Study recommendation of a demand-based parking program that adjusts rates and regulations to make it as easy as possible for users to find a parking space. The main goal is to ensure consistent availability of parking spaces, while distributing parking demand throughout the Coastal Zone. Ideally, this demand-based program would allow off-street parking, such as those in the City lots and the parking structure, to be a cheaper long-term option as opposed to using on-street spaces for long-term parking. Alternatively, on-street parking should be available as a short-term parking solution. Demand-based pricing or adjustments to time restrictions may also be considered as an alternative to certain time limits placed on different parking spaces to generate optimal turnover of parking spaces. The Parking Study suggests the City should price public parking assets at a lower rate for centralized locations in order to promote a “Park once/walk many” environment.

Street Metered and Public Parking Lot Meters

Metered and pay-by-space parking is available for \$1.25 per hour (daily 8:00 a.m. or 10:00 a.m., depending on location, to 8:00 p.m.) and \$1.50 per hour (daily 8:00 p.m. to 2:00 a.m.) in City lots, the downtown parking structure, and along streets and alleys. A survey of meter and lot rate comparisons with other cities is included as **Attachment B1**.

The history of meter rate increases is described in the following table:

<i>Meter Rates– History of Rate Increases</i>	
Year of Last Increase	Rate
2001	\$.75/hour
2003	\$1.00/hour
2010	\$1.25/hour
2016	\$1.50/hour Demand pricing implemented from 8pm to 2 am for Upper Pier Avenue, Hermosa Avenue, Lots A, B, D and silver meters

Lots A and C, which had previously been closed due to the pandemic, changed to three hours maximum as part of temporary emergency orders. At its July 28, 2020 meeting, City Council approved the reopening of these lots with three-hour maximums in recognition of pandemic concerns. Parking was previously 24 hours.

Parking Citation Fines

Another parking management solution is to review parking citation fines. If fines are too low, the cost may not be a deterrent to comply with parking regulations. During the 2019 City Council Budget Workshop, staff recommended the consideration of select citation fine increases. At that time, Council requested a survey of parking citation fines in other cities be compiled. A summary survey and a detail survey to compare parking citation fines with other cities are included as **Attachments B2 and B3**.

The parking citation amounts have been increased or amended only a few times since June 2008. Those increases or changes are described in the following table:

Summary of Recent Hermosa Beach Parking Citation Fines	
Year of Increase	Actions
June 2008	Fines increased by \$5 with exception of Red Zone/Curb and Parking Meter Zones that increased by \$10.
March 2009	Fines increased for all citations including CA Vehicle Code citations by \$.50 to make fee amounts an even number since DMV does not accept partial dollar amounts.
June 2013	New citation types were added to the schedule and increased fees for three citations: Interfering with an Officer, Driving on Sidewalk, and Defacing or Injuring Meters.
July 2013	Citation fees for mobile food vendors parking violations were added to the citation schedule.
July 2017	Citations for oversize vehicle parking violations were added to the citation schedule.
June 2018	City Council Budget Workshop recommendations for increased parking citation fines. No increases were adopted at that time.

Electric Vehicle (EV) Charging Spaces

Council previously authorized the waiver of parking meter fees at silver post meters for 100 percent alternative fuel vehicles and the provision of complimentary electric vehicle charging at most stations throughout the City. This incentive was initially approved in April 2010 and re-authorized by Council in November 2019. The current policy does not include a mechanism to verify that a vehicle meets the criteria, such as a DMV issued current clean air vehicle decal, making enforcement by Community Service Officers difficult. Demand for EV parking and charging has increased dramatically since 2010, and community members are sometimes unable to find available EV charging spaces in the most popular locations.

Currently, all Level 2 stations in Hermosa Beach are available for free charging up to two hours. The Level 3 station located on the top floor of Lot C Downtown parking structure currently requires payment to charge. Payment at Level 3 stations are made directly to the vendor, EVgo, and do not represent revenue to the City. Level 2 stations provide normal slow charging and Level 3 stations offer fast charging. Separate from the free charging, EV stations located in Lot A and Lot C parking structure require customers to pay for the cost of parking at the standard rate of \$1.25 to \$1.50 per hour. All other EV City charging stations do not require a fee to park.

The City currently maintains a network of 35 free and publicly accessible charging stations and

covers the cost of the equipment, electricity, and any maintenance of these stations. The City's current network of EV charging infrastructure includes five different vendors or types of equipment and different levels of network connectivity and point of sale capabilities. Additionally, the different stations vary on their electric connectivity with some infrastructure on separate SCE meters or accounts and others on a meter or account for a larger facility. This variability makes it difficult to estimate with a high-degree of certainty the direct electricity costs associated with the charging stations. Noting the variability in both the level and time of use, staff has used a conservative estimate of approximately \$70,000 in annual electricity costs for all these charging stations. Private chargers were also made available in the City in recent years.

Through various budget and EV policy related discussions, City Council has expressed interest in considering whether to retain free charging and/or parking associated with EV charging stations or consider adopting a fee that would generate revenue to help offset the City's electricity and maintenance costs associated with this infrastructure. There are a variety of rate setting options to consider (flat fee for power only, graduated rates to encourage turnover of vehicles, etc.) and one or more could be analyzed more comprehensively and brought back for consideration.

Part C-review Residential and Employee Parking Permit Program

Residential Parking Permit Program

In 1984, the City of Hermosa Beach applied for and was granted permission by the California Coastal Commission to establish a preferential parking permit program in conjunction with remote beach parking locations and a park and ride shuttle system. The permit was most recently amended in 2004 and no longer includes a park and ride shuttle system (**Attachment C1**). The preferential parking permit program was developed to discourage oversaturation of the City's downtown and coastal parking, to provide free long-term parking at inland locations, and to allow residents within the impacted area to park beyond the one-hour time restrictions or without having to pay the meter at yellow pole/cap meters. The impacted area is bound by the North and South City boundaries; by the Strand on the West; and by Loma Drive, Park Avenue, or Morningside Drive on the East. Parking spaces on the West side of Cypress Avenue between 11th Street and Pier Avenue are also included.

Residential parking permits are issued on an annual basis and cost \$40 per year. Vehicle permits are available at a rate of one non-transferrable sticker per vehicle registered to an address or apartment unit (no limit on number of vehicles) and one transferrable hang tag guest permit per address or apartment unit. As part of the program, a property owner not residing at the address may also obtain one guest permit per address or apartment unit, as well as stickers for each of their vehicles. Residential parking permits allow residents to park at 24-hour meters without paying the meter, or in one-hour residential zones without time limits for up to 72 hours.

Currently, the City does not place a limit on the number of permits purchased per household. The Parking Study notes that many residents utilize their garage space as storage rather than parking

spaces and park on-street, which adds more resident vehicles occupying street parking spaces. The Parking Study further identified that more parking permits are issued than spaces are available.

The Parking Study confirms that the \$40 annual parking permit fee is well below the fair market value and the price of the permits has not been adjusted in over 10 years. The study recommends revisions to the program with scaled permit prices to disincentivize the oversaturation of parking permits purchased.

The Parking Study recommends the first annual permit per household be increased slightly to \$50 remaining close to the current rate, while the second permit is priced at \$75, the third at \$100, and a guest or fourth permit at \$150 for a maximum of four permits per unit. This recommendation is consistent with the practice that other municipalities employ to discourage the misuse of residential parking permits.

One of the challenges of the current residential parking program is the high number of permits issued, limiting on-street parking for residents and visitors without parking permits and limiting necessary beach access. Some households obtain multiple permits, in some cases a greater number of permits than a reasonable household would need, as shown in the following table:

<i>Number of Residential Permits</i>		<i>Per Address</i>	<i>2021</i>	
Number of Addresses	Number of Permits	Allowed 4 Permits	Issued	Excess Permits Issued Over 4
900	1			
1,535	2			
789	3			
324	4			
132	5	528	660	132
65	6	260	390	130
33	7	132	231	99
14	8	56	112	56
11	9	44	99	55
3	10	12	30	18
4	11	16	44	28
0	12	0	0	0
0	13	0	0	0
0	14	0	0	0
0	15	0	0	0
1	16	4	16	12
0	17	0	0	0
1	18	4	18	14
0	19	0	0	0
2	20	8	40	32
1	25	4	25	21
3,815	9677	1,058	1,665	597

The Parking Study recommends a maximum of four parking permits be issued to each household. Elimination of the number exceeding four parking passes last year would result in a reduction of 597 permits issued, or 6 percent of the 9,677 permits issued in 2021.

The most recent rate increase for Residential and Guest Parking Permits was made in 2008, when both permit rates were increased from \$38 to \$40 as shown in below table.

<i>Preferential Residential Permits – Year of Last Increase</i>			
Type	Year of Last Rate Increase	Current Rate	Previous Rate
Vehicle	2008	\$40	\$38
Guest	2008	\$40	\$38

Monthly and Employee Parking Permit Program

For those who work in Hermosa Beach and do not have parking available through their employer, monthly and annual parking passes are available. Monthly permits are available to anyone for off-street parking lots and the Downtown parking structure at a cost of \$62 per month to park anytime up to 72 hours or \$31 per month to park only between 5:00 a.m. to 7:00 p.m. daily.

Employee permits are also available to purchase that allow employees to park at on-street spaces with yellow pole/cap meters and in the unmetered one-hour time restricted areas at an annual cost of \$143 when employers are within the impact zone as shown on the Public Parking Map link listed in **Attachment C2**.

The Parking Study recommends the employee parking permit program be retained, but that the City should update the locations and pricing of employee permit parking to encourage off-street parking availability for employees and that on-street parking be reserved for short-term users to promote higher turnover.

The following table provides a comparison of employee parking rates in area cities:

Employee Parking			
City	Location	Rate	Options
Hermosa Beach	Impacted Area	\$143	Annual
Manhattan Beach	Downtown North End Business	\$27/\$160	Monthly & Semi-Annual
Redondo Beach	Riviera Village	\$60	Annual
Santa Monica	Beach/Downtown	\$6-\$9 \$20 - \$220 \$105 \$155	Daily Validation Monthly Semi-Annual Annual
West Hollywood	Specified Streets	Tiered by month in Quarter \$45/\$90/\$135	Monthly, 2/3 Qtr., Quarterly
	Various Locations & Parking Structures	\$30-\$90	Evening Only Monthly and Quarterly
	Specified Streets, greater number than other permits	Tiered in Quarter \$60/\$120/\$180	Monthly, 2/3 Qtr., Quarterly Not open to New Applicants
Culver City	Specified Streets	\$120	Monthly

The most recent rate increase for Employee Parking Permits was made in 2006, when permit rates were increased from \$66 to \$143 as shown in the following table:

Employee Permits – History of Most Recent Rates	
Rate	Year
\$66	2006
\$143	2007 - present

The City issues several types of parking permits in addition to the Residential Parking Permits and Employee Parking Permits, which are the focus of this discussion. All of the City-issued permits are included in **Attachment C3**.

Coastal Commission Authority

Given that the City's public lots, street metered parking, residential and employee parking program are all largely in the Coastal Zone, all changes to these programs require their review and approval, and likely will be viewed as part of the City's overall approach to managing parking and public access

in the Coastal Zone. The overall approach should be considered in context of the Coastal Act and the City's certified LUP. Coastal Commission staff's frequently cited sections of the Coastal Act and Hermosa Beach's certified LUP related to public access and parking include the following:

Section 30210 of the Coastal Act states: In carrying out the requirement of Section 4 of Article X of the California Constitution, maximum access, which shall be conspicuously posted, and recreational opportunities shall be provided for all the people consistent with public safety needs and the need to protect public rights, rights of private property owners, and natural resource areas from overuse.

Section 30211 of the Coastal Act states: Development shall not interfere with the public's right of access to the sea where acquired through use or legislative authorization, including, but not limited to, the use of dry sand and rocky coastal beaches to the first line of terrestrial vegetation.

Hermosa Beach certified LUP Section III(A) states: To preserve and increase where feasible, residential, commercial, and general public parking within the Coastal Zone.

Hermosa Beach certified LUP Section III(C)(1) states, in relevant part: Policy: That the City should not allow the elimination of existing on-street parking or off-street parking spaces within the coastal zone. Given the Commission's authority, staff cautions against any significant incremental pricing changes or program changes without an overall program approach, or implementing before Commission approval.

Summary:

This parking program update provides important context in Council consideration of next steps with respect to any adjustments or pricing changes to parking programs. In considering next steps, staff suggests the Council authorize the City Manager to discuss parking topics with Coastal Commission staff and support continuing efforts to implement a strategic and comprehensive approach as reflected in the Parking Study, that aligns and advances all the City's goals as reflected in PLAN Hermosa but specifically respect to Mobility, Economic Vitality, and Sustainability.

With respect to shorter term adjustment to parking programs Council may want to consider the following direction:

- Provide direction to staff on specific parking program elements and pricing adjustments that have immediate priority;
- Direct the City Manager to incorporate these into the LUP update in process through discussions with the Coastal Commission staff, focusing on finding points of agreement of short-term program and pricing adjustments; and/or
- Implement any first step pricing adjustments only after acceptance from the Coastal

Commission, and assurance that any initial steps would not affect the LCP update and certification process underway.

The following program adjustments could be implemented before review by Coastal Commission:

1. Limit residential parking passes to four per household;
2. Eliminate Temporary Emergency Orders that changed Lots A and C to 3 hours maximum and return to 24-hour lots;
3. Consider revising citation fines to average of survey cities (**Attachments B2 and B3**) or other selected fine amounts; and
4. Revision of EV vehicle parking and charging rate options (flat fee for power only, graduated rates to encourage turnover of vehicles, etc.).

The Council could provide specific direction on parking program adjustments priorities to pursue with Coastal Commission including:

1. Adjustment of parking meter rates;
2. Adjustment of Resident Parking Permit fees. As recommended in the Parking Study, the first annual Resident Parking Permit fee per household be increased slightly to \$50 remaining close to the current rate, while the second permit is priced at \$75, the third at \$100, and a guest or fourth permit at \$150 for a maximum of four permits per unit; and/or
3. Adjustments to employee parking permit program.

General Plan Consistency:

This report and associated recommendation have been evaluated for their consistency with the City's General Plan. Relevant Policies are listed below:

Mobility Element

Goal 4. A parking system that meets the parking needs and demand of residents, visitors, and employees in an efficient and cost-effective manner.

Policies:

- **4.2 Encourage coastal access.** Ensure parking facilities and costs of such facilities are not a barrier to beach access by the public.
- **4.3 Reduce impacts.** Reduce spillover parking impacts due to employee parking and seasonal event-based demands.
- **4.4 Preferential parking program.** Periodically study and evaluate the current inventory of public parking supply and update the preferential parking program.
- **4.6 Priority parking.** Provide priority parking and charging stations to accommodate the use of Electric Vehicles (EVs), including smaller short-distance neighborhood electric vehicles.
- **4.7 Parking availability.** Optimize parking availability through dynamically adjusted pricing and

new technology to manage available spaces for short-term parking use to encourage rates of turnover that are responsive to fluctuating demands.

- **4.8 Ensure commercial parking.** Ensure that prime commercial parking spaces are available for customers and other short-term users throughout the day.
- **4.9 Encourage TDM strategies.** Encourage use of transportation demand management strategies and programs such as carpooling, ride hailing, and alternative transportation modes as a way to reduce demand for additional parking supply.
- **4.10 Visitor parking information.** Manage information about passes and accessing public parking lots to facilitate use by longer-distance visitors with limited transportation choices.
- **4.11 Consolidated parking facilities.** Consider the development of new small-scale parking structures or shared facilities outside of the Downtown core and incorporate adaptability standards so that they may serve other uses in the future.

Attachments for Part A-review of Coastal Parking Management Study Recommendations:

1. Table of Recommendations and Status
2. 2019 Coastal Zone Parking Management Study
3. City's Local Coastal Plan
4. Link to June 6, 2018 City Council Budget Workshop (see Draft Forecast and Financial Plan Attachment p.11)
5. Link to December 17, 2019 City Council Meeting
6. Link to September 14, 2021 City Council Meeting
7. Link to September 28, 2021 City Council Meeting

Attachments for Part B-review Street Metered and Public Parking Lot Metered Programs Including Rates

1. Meter and Lot Rate Comparisons with Other Cities
2. Parking Citation Summary Fine Comparisons with Other Cities
3. Parking Citation Detail Fine Comparisons with Other Cities

Attachment for Part C-review Residential and Employee Parking Permit Program

1. City's Coastal Development Permit for Residential Preferential Parking District
2. Public Parking Map with Residential and Employee Impacted Parking Areas
3. Number of Parking Permits by Fiscal Year

Respectfully Submitted by: Christy Teague, Senior Planner

Concur: Ken Robertson, Community Development Director

Viki Copeland, Finance Director

Peter Ahlstrom, Police Community Services Manager

Doug Krauss, Environmental Programs Manager

Approved: Suja Lowenthal, City Manager